MINUTES OF THE PLAN COMMISSION MEETING ON TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 8, 2020

HELD VIA ZOOM MEETING

NOTICE: Pursuant to the current recommendation of the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention: Limiting the size of public gatherings and the various federal and state orders implementing that recommendation, and to help protect our community from the Coronavirus (COVID-19) pandemic, this meeting was held virtually through the Zoom platform with each member accessing the meeting remotely as detailed below.

https://zoom.us/webinar/register/WN_74y1tgUdTuaJcHwTQk-MKA

1. The meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Mayor Michael Neitzke

ROLL CALL:	Mayor Michael Neitzke	Present
	Ald. Karl Kastner	Present
	Mr. Brian Weis	Present
	Ms. Christine Hallen	Present
	Mr. Steve Rogers	Present at approx.. 6:28pm
	Mr. Don Carlson	Present
	Mr. David Schilz	Present
	Mr. Robert Krenz (alt.)	Present
	Mr. Michael Braswell (alt.)	Present

ALSO PRESENT: Kristi Porter – Community Development Manager

2. Approval of the minutes from the August 11, 2020 meeting.

Motion by Ms. Hallen, seconded by Ald. Kastner, to approve the August 11, 2020 Meeting minutes. Motion carried unanimously with Mr. Carlson abstaining from the August 11, 2020 meeting minutes motion.

3. Discussion regarding last Common Council meetings.
Ms. Porter stated that there were no Plan Commission-related public hearings at the August 18, 2020 Common Council meeting.

4A. Conceptual Plan Review for proposed new construction of a multi-family housing development, Parkwood Commons, to be located at 5401 W. Layton Ave., submitted by Scott Kwiecinski, d/b/a Horizon Development Group, Inc., and Lawrence Kleczka, d/b/a River Falls Recreation, Inc. (Tax Key No. 619-9997-003)

4B. Resolution to adopt a Land Use Map amendment to the 2008 City of Greenfield Comprehensive Plan for the property located at 5401 W. Layton Ave. from Planned Business to Planned Mixed Use. (Tax Key No. 619-9997-003) (Resolution No. 2020-1)

4C. Ordinance to amend the official Greenfield Zoning Map by rezoning the property located at 5401 W. Layton Ave. from C-2 Community Commercial District to PUD Planned Unit Development. (Tax Key No. 619-9997-003)

Items 4A, 4B and 4C may be considered together.

Overview and Conceptual Project

Horizon Development Group and Midwest Affordable Housing ("Horizon") has submitted an application for a rezone and Comprehensive Land Use Map amendment for the parcel located at 5401 W. Layton Ave. (River Falls Family Fun Center/miniature golf site). The change is requested to accommodate a proposed multi-family residential redevelopment of the site, to be called Parkwood Commons. Horizon intends to submit an application to the Wisconsin Housing and Economic Development Association (WHEDA) through a competitive tax credit application process for a 100-unit multi-family development. The application is due in December 2020 and projects are awarded based on a scoring process.

Horizon Develop Build Manage is a Madison, Wisconsin-based group of companies specializing in full-service development, construction, and management of residential multi-family real estate. In its 36-year history, Horizon has developed 90 housing communities and manages nearly 3,000 units in the Midwest. Horizon has a Milwaukee area office, located at 3900 S. Prairie Hill Lane in Greenfield, and has developed seven (7) projects in the City totaling 402 units since 1998. 263 of these units are located in the Woodland Ridge housing community located near 84th and Howard.

Midwest Affordable Housing Corporation (MAHC) is the co-developer and a 501c3 nonprofit with a mission to foster, develop, and preserve affordable housing. To date, MAHC has been involved in the acquisition, development, and management of 535 affordable housing units. Horizon and MAHC have partnered on 4 other similar projects in recent years. The president of MAHC is Philip Schultz, a former employee and shareholder of Horizon, who brings many years of development experience and who has worked closely with the City of Greenfield on past projects.

Horizon's multifamily portfolio maintains an overall occupancy over 97.3%. Over many years and projects completed, they remain focused on housing quality as an essential ingredient to management success. Thoughtful programming, design, and high-quality construction are biproducts of their integrated group of companies working together to create a lasting community.

Additionally, through the WHEDA tax credit program, housing tax credits fund about 50-60% of project costs, which generally allow high-quality construction to be maintained similar to traditionally-funded projects. The WHEDA program also incentivizes energy efficient design practices, resulting in quality building systems, insulation, fixtures, etc.

The project, if successful in moving forward, would be owned 99.99% by a tax credit equity investor for a 15-year period (10 years tax credits, plus 5 years compliance). Following that period, the intention would be for Horizon and/or MAHC to own and manage the property. The housing community would remain affordable for 30 years minimum as part of the tax credit requirements.

Parkwood Commons will be managed locally and have management staff available on site. Like other properties, staff would be available during posted office hours and assist with leasing and general property management functions. Horizon also employs full-time maintenance technicians; one technician works out of Greenfield and would be responsible for servicing this property.

A limited market study was completed for the proposed project to evaluate supply, demand and market performance indicators. The market study determined there is adequate demand for the development including the following findings: (1) weighted average vacancy rate of 3% among Primary Market Area (PMA) independent senior properties and 1.1% among affordable independent senior properties; (2) high occupancy levels among primary market area rental properties and comparable properties; (3) based on the absorption rates of similar housing in the area, the absorption analysis has determined that Parkwood Commons will reach 95% occupancy in 9 months; and, (4) strong PMA demand, 9.6% penetration rate for the subject's independent senior units and 1.2% penetration rate for the subject's family units.

Parkwood Commons is proposed as a 100-unit housing development in two buildings. The first building would be a three-story, 86-unit mixed-income independent senior apartment community (age-restricted at 62+), and the second building a 2-story, 14-unit non age-restricted townhome building. Residents will enjoy access to community amenities, with a public park, grocery store, public library, health care, retail, continuing education opportunities, public transit stops, and public schools all located within half a mile of the subject site and accessible via public sidewalk.

The independent senior building (86 units) will include a mix of one- and two-bedroom apartments, an on-site leasing office, a clubroom/lounge area, a fitness center, tenant storage lockers, and heated underground parking. The unit mix consists of 29 one-bedrooms planned at 680 square feet and 57 two-bedrooms ranging from 980-1,040 square feet. All units will have energy-efficient appliances, in-unit washer/dryers, and private patio or balconies.

The affordable family townhomes will consist of 14 three-bedroom units, each approximately 1,300 square feet and having ground floor, private entries. Units will have energy-efficient appliances, in-unit washer/dryers, and private patio/balcony space.

Parkwood Commons will provide affordable rents to a variety of households and income demographics. The senior housing building will contain 15 market rate units and 71 units rented to households with qualifying incomes at or below 60% of area median income, while the 14 family townhomes will be rented to households earning no more than 50% of area median income. In total, there will be 85 units of income-restricted housing and 15 units of market rate.

Tenant income ranges for the project will vary depending on: (1) the unit being applied for – whether a 30%, 50%, 60% or market rate unit; and, (2) the household size, which may vary whether a senior living unit or family townhouse unit. Horizon Management Services will be the property manager and has extensive experience in the Greenfield area as well as tax credit compliance in general. Each applicant will undergo a background check and credit screening, as well as certification of household income per tax credit guidelines. Parkwood Commons will be required to follow current HUD estimated county median income. As an example, the estimated maximum 2020 Milwaukee County median income for a 1- or 2-person household applying for a 60% unit is $35,220 (1-person household) and $40,260 (2-person household). For a 50% unit (1, 2, or 3 bedrooms possible based on unit mix), the income limit would start at $29,350 (1 person) and increase based on number of household members. A 5-person household would have a 50% income limit of $45,300. Lastly, for a 30% unit, the estimated maximum 2020 Milwaukee County median income is $17,610 (1-person household) and $20,130 (2-person household). In summary, based on the household sizes mentioned, estimated household income ranges could be from $17,610 to $45,300. Per Horizon, it is common for a range of local employment options to be represented in this income range, including education, fire, law enforcement, service industries, retail, and positions in manufacturing, industrial, and health care. The seniors that will live at this development (86 of 100 units) may be on fixed income (social security), pension or other retirement savings. Per Horizon, many qualifying households may come from a relatively short distance, meaning many of the units at Parkwood Commons will serve those already in the community or surrounding area. Whether a senior who has lived in Greenfield for years and wishes to remain part of the community, or a family looking for an affordable option that is close to work, the project aims to serve a local market demographic and need.

In terms of project costs and sources of funding, Horizon estimates a total project cost and local investment of $21,684,000. Anticipated/requested funding sources include Federal Home Loan Bank funding (application submitted), a permanent first mortgage, Milwaukee County HOME funds, affordable housing tax credit equity, developer contribution, and a developer-funded tax increment financing.

The anticipated project timeline is to apply for tax credits in December 2020. In order to be competitive in this application process, permissive zoning must be approved, and the groundwork for financial assistance must be reviewed and approved also. Once a tax credit application is submitted, the allocating agency (WHEDA) would likely make award announcements by April 2021. If successful, and if other financing commitments are achieved, the design, underwriting, and bidding/permitting process would begin right away, which would take several months to complete. Horizon's goal would be to close and start construction by fall 2021 on the 14-unit townhome building and begin construction on the 86-unit by spring 2022. This would allow buildings to be completed at favorable times of year for leasing purposes. The entire 100-unit project would be completed by spring 2023.

Horizon is seeking support for the conceptual plan to develop a 100-unit multi-family development at this site. However, Horizon is seeking actual rezoning and Comprehensive Land Use Map approval, which is needed in order to competitively submit the WHEDA tax credit application. The public hearing process would immediately move forward if the Plan Commission recommends favorably of the proposed Resolution and Ordinance (public hearing can be held as early as November 17, 2020—a 30-day public comment period is required for the Comprehensive Land Use Map amendment). If Horizon is awarded the tax credit application, they will bring final site, landscaping and architectural plans to the Plan Commission and Common Council for review and approval in 2021.

Zoning and Comprehensive Land Use Map

The River Falls Family Fun Center is currently zoned C-2 Community Commercial District. The 2008 Comprehensive Land Use Map identifies this parcel as "Planned Business." The Plan Commission discussed this parcel during the updated Comprehensive Land Use Map amendment planning process at the end of 2019 and had suggested changing the land use category to "Planned Mixed Use" for this parcel. Planned Mixed Use could encompass commercial and residential uses together, or either use on its own. Horizon is proposing to officially amend the Comprehensive Land Use Map from Planned Business to Planned Mixed Use and rezone the parcel from C-2 to Planned Unit

Development (PUD). The rezone would not be possible without the Comprehensive Land Use Map amendment. The current property owner of the River Falls Family Fun Center signed the application and is a co-applicant for the rezoning and land use map amendment.

The Plan Commission adopts a Resolution, per State Statutes, that recommends Common Council approval of an ordinance to amend the Land Use Map. The Plan Commission would also make a recommendation to the Common Council for the rezoning.

Horizon's redevelopment efforts include only a portion of the site (the eastern 3.4 acres of the 5.04-acre site). A future, undetermined project that is compatible and synergistic with housing would be located on remaining site area. The proposed Land Use Map amendment to Planned Mixed Use and the proposed rezoning to PUD would be compatible with a future housing and/or commercial/mixed-use use on the undeveloped portion (the remaining 1.64 acres) of the site.

Site Plan

Horizon's conceptual plan includes a 3-story U-shaped building in the rear of the site that would house 86 unit. The building would include underground parking and roughly 13 on-site parking spaces on the western side of the building. Along W. Layton Ave. the 2-story 14-unit townhouse would be constructed. The site plan includes roughly 36 on-site parking spaces on the east, south and west sides of the building, and an 8-car garage on the far eastern side of the parcel. There would be one drive into the site from W. Layton Ave.

Architectural Plans

Horizon has provided sample imagery attachments of some of their existing multi-family developments for conceptual purposes regarding the style and product quality they may propose for the Parkwood Commons project in Greenfield. The sample imagery projects include: Woodland Ridge – 263 units, Greenfield, WI; Hill Crest Senior Apartments, 41 units, Greenfield, WI; Applewood IV Senior Apartments, 60 units, Dubuque, IA; Cedar Glen Senior Apartments – 80 units, Wauwatosa, WI; Walnut Glen Apartments – 101 units, Wauwatosa, WI (design in progress).

Recommendation: Approve a Resolution to adopt a Land Use Map amendment to the 2008 City of Greenfield Comprehensive Plan for the property located at 5401 W. Layton Ave. from Planned Business to Planned Mixed Use (Resolution No. 2020-1), and recommend Common Council approval of the Ordinance to amend the official Greenfield Zoning Map by rezoning the property located at 5401 W. Layton Ave. from C-

2 Community Commercial District to PUD Planned Unit Development District. (Tax Key no. 619-9997-003)

Ms. Porter provided a presentation of the proposal.

The Mayor commented about the strategic difficulty of approving a Comprehensive Land Use Map amendment and a rezoning, with only a conceptual site, landscaping and architectural plan, and the potential that the proposed housing project does not take place and the property is officially rezoned, and how that request is out of order to how the City typically approves rezoning. He recognized that the need of the developer is to have new zoning in place in order to competitively apply for a WHEDA grant.

Mr. Rogers was present at this time, 6:28pm.

The Mayor stated that he has heard general comments/questions from citizens inquiring about the City purchasing 5401 W. Layton Ave., to incorporate the parcel as part of the City Center with civic uses and Konkel Park in immediate proximity. The Mayor stated that the City has not done any due diligence or analysis, however, regarding acquisition cost, operating expenses, etc. The Mayor stated that the first decision the City needs to make, is what does the City want to see on this property?

Mr. Schilz stated that he didn't think apartments were the right fit at this location, surrounded by other civic uses and Konkel Park immediately to the east. He would like to think more about how this development would impact the City and all of its citizens, than focus on how it would impact 100 new units.

Mr. Braswell asked if the City is looking to expand the City's population. The Mayor commented that there will be many more multi-family development proposals coming in the future, such as those that have recently been before the Plan Commission, and possibly at Spring Mall, and possibly at Loomis Crossing (I-894 and W. Loomis Rd.).

The Mayor said he'd like to gauge the Plan Commissioner's opinion on this proposal. Ms. Hallen stated that she was not in favor of this proposal and that the City is always looking at the best use of land because Greenfield is landlocked. Mr. Krenz stated that he thought it was too early in the process for the Plan Commission to make a decision this evening. Mr. Weis stated that he did not think that the proposal was the highest and best use for the property in question and that the City may have only one opportunity to approve the right project for this parcel. He felt that more time was needed to analyze the right use for this parcel and was not in favor of putting the cart before the horse. Mr. Rogers stated that he was not quite as opposed to the use of apartments since there are apartments to the south, however, he wasn't quite in favor of apartments along W. Layton Ave. and thought commercial uses were more appropriate. Mr. Carlson was also concerned about putting the cart before the horse and asked if rezoning could take place again if the WHEDA application isn't awarded. Ms. Porter replied that the current property owner certainly could request to rezone the property back to C-2. Ald. Kastner stated that he's not necessarily against housing at this location, and acknowledged that it is a marketable site with the park next door. He stated that he had confidence in the developer, but expressed concern about the request to rezone and approve a Land Use Map amendment before being provided the details of the development.

Mr. Weis stated that if housing was considered for this site, he envisioned more high-end development, such as The Forte at 84 South.

Mr. Kwiecinski with Horizon Development summarized Horizon's experience with multi-family development. He stated that their interest in this site was generated by demographics, vacancy rates, and surrounding amenities (schools, library, park, grocery store, etc.). Mr. Kwiecinski stated that this site has been available/for sale for a long time, and if the City is not interested in multi-family development, what is it interested in and what other interest has the City received for this site? He cited a statistic that seniors prefer to stay in their community when they move out of their house into senior development and Horizon wanted to provide a high-quality place for Greenfield seniors to live in. Mr. Kwiecinski asked if Horizon should explore market-rate apartments for this site, but stated that feasibility studies need to be conducted.

Mr. Weis said he thinks housing could fit on this property, but would like to see high-end. Ms. Hallen didn't see apartment buildings at this location, that it wouldn't have a community feel on W. Layton Ave. Mr. Rogers stated that he was more for residential uses than against residential. Mr. Carlson stated he wouldn't be against a residential project as long as it was good quality. He added that a senior development shouldn't impact traffic on W. Layton Ave. Mr. Krenz said he didn't have an issue with the developer or a high-end apartment building. Mr. Schilz repeated that he doesn't see residential being a good fit for this site and the City as an entirety needs to be considered.

Mr. Braswell asked if Horizon would consider market-rate or what their back-up would be if they are not awarded tax credits from WHEDA. Mr. Kwiecinski stated that Horizon likely would not move forward with this WHEDA application if the zoning was not approved because they wouldn't have a competitive application. Mr. Kwiecinski commented that a tax credit project was equally "high quality" as a market-rate apartment complex, and that if those two different buildings were built next to each other, you wouldn't know the difference, from a quality perspective, from the outside or inside.

Ms. Porter explained that projects applying for WHEDA tax credits, need to be ready to go, investors require ready-to-go projects; hence Horizon's request to rezone the property.

Mr. Braswell stated that he would not be against housing, as long as it is a high-quality project.

Mr. Rogers stated that he's not against residential at this site, but encouraged a high-end quality project. He added that something should blend well with the park and not be intrusive.

Ms. Hallen stated that she thinks Greenfield has too many apartments and would like to see more single-family homes being built.

Mr. Weis stated that he believes higher density development is trending, younger people are not ready for a house yet, and single-family is often cost-prohibitive. He stated that he's supportive of a higher-quality, higher-density project next to the City Center.

The Mayor stated that Greenfield's amenities and central location makes development attractive to developers like Horizon.

Mr. Kwiecinski stated that he believed the demographics would support affordable housing more than market-rate, but that Horizon would need to conduct due diligence to confirm that feasibility.

Motion by Ald. Kastner, seconded by Mr. Carlson to approve the Resolution to adopt a Land Use Map amendment to the 2008 City of Greenfield Comprehensive Plan for the property located at 5401 W. Layton Ave. from Planned Business to Planned Mixed Use. (Tax Key No. 619-9997-003) (Resolution No. 2020-1)

Under discussion, Ald. Kastner stated that the Plan Commission had recommended the Comprehensive Land Use Map amendment to Planned Mixed Use for the property at 5401 W. Layton Ave., in 2019, which is why he made his motion for approval of the resolution.

The motion failed 3-4, with Ald. Kastner, Mr. Rogers and Mr. Carlson voting yes, and Mr. Weis, Ms. Hallen, Mr. Schilz and Mayor Neitzke voting no.

Motion by Ald. Kastner to table the recommendation of an Ordinance to amend the official Greenfield Zoning Map by rezoning the property located at 5401 W. Layton Ave. from C-2 Community Commercial District to PUD Planned Unit Development. (Tax Key No. 619-9997-003) The motion carried unanimously.

11. Community Development Manager Report

Ms. Porter stated it was expected that Festival Foods (former Target site on S. 27 St.) and The Grove (124th & Edgerton) would be submitting projects for the October Plan Commission meeting. Ms. Porter added that plans for the Creekside Condos on S. 124 St. and W. Waterford Ave. would be bringing a plan forward in the near future. The Mayor mentioned that Starbucks at Loomis and Layton was open and that there were parking and stacking problems. Ms. Hallen confirmed problems with parking, stacking and damage to the road. The Mayor also stated that there have been recent inquiries from developers on potential development of Spring Mall; there is movement with the developer of I-894 and Loomis regarding land acquisition; W. Layton Ave. is being reconstructed by the County in 2021 between S. 27 St. and W. Loomis Rd.; S. 68 St. bridge is complete; the S. 60 St. bridge is next in line, with a late 2021 start date; construction of the multi-tenant commercial building at S. 76 St. and W. Holmes Ave. is underway; Lou Malnati's on S. 76 St. and W. Layton Ave. has their sign up and should be opening soon; Applebee's on S. 76 St. has been purchased by a credit union, which will propose demolition/new construction. Mr. Carlson mentioned that Crossroads Café on W. Loomis Rd. and S. 43 St. Mr. Rogers mentioned the new pedestrian pathway on the south side of Konkel Park is open.

12. Adjournment.

Motion by Mayor Neitzke, seconded by Ms. Hallen, to adjourn the meeting at 7:46 p.m. Motion carried unanimously.

Respectfully submitted,

Kristi Porter
Community Development Manager

Distributed September 14, 2020